



# Council

---

**Wednesday 28 March 2018**

**5.00 pm**

**Council Chamber, Town Hall,  
Pinstone Street, Sheffield, S1 2HH**

**The Press and Public are Welcome to Attend**

---

## COUNCIL

---

**Wednesday 28 March 2018, at 5.00 pm**  
**Council Chamber, Town Hall, Pinstone Street, Sheffield, S1 2HH**

**The Press and Public are Welcome to Attend**

### MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL

THE LORD MAYOR (Councillor Anne Murphy)  
THE DEPUTY LORD MAYOR (Councillor Magid Magid)

1	<i>Beauchief &amp; Greenhill Ward</i> Andy Nash Bob Pullin Richard Shaw	10	<i>East Ecclesfield Ward</i> Pauline Andrews Andy Bainbridge Steve Wilson	19	<i>Nether Edge &amp; Sharrow Ward</i> Mohammad Maroof Jim Steinke Alison Teal
2	<i>Beighton Ward</i> Chris Rosling-Josephs Ian Saunders Sophie Wilson	11	<i>Ecclesall Ward</i> Roger Davison Shaffaq Mohammed Paul Scriven	20	<i>Park &amp; Arbourthorne Ward</i> Julie Dore Ben Miskell Jack Scott
3	<i>Birley Ward</i> Denise Fox Bryan Lodge Karen McGowan	12	<i>Firth Park Ward</i> Abdul Khayum Alan Law Abtisam Mohamed	21	<i>Richmond Ward</i> Mike Drabble Dianne Hurst Peter Rippon
4	<i>Broomhill &amp; Sharrow Vale Ward</i> Michelle Cook Kieran Harpham Magid Magid	13	<i>Fulwood Ward</i> Sue Alston Andrew Sangar Cliff Woodcraft	22	<i>Shiregreen &amp; Brightside Ward</i> Dawn Dale Peter Price Garry Weatherall
5	<i>Burngreave Ward</i> Jackie Drayton Talib Hussain Mark Jones	14	<i>Gleadless Valley Ward</i> Lewis Dagnall Cate McDonald Chris Peace	23	<i>Southey Ward</i> Mike Chaplin Tony Damms Jayne Dunn
6	<i>City Ward</i> Douglas Johnson Robert Murphy Moya O'Rourke	15	<i>Graves Park Ward</i> Ian Auckland Sue Auckland Steve Ayriss	24	<i>Stannington Ward</i> David Baker Penny Baker Vickie Priestley
7	<i>Crookes &amp; Crosspool Ward</i> Craig Gamble Pugh Adam Hanrahan Anne Murphy	16	<i>Hillsborough Ward</i> Bob Johnson George Lindars-Hammond Josie Paszek	25	<i>Stocksbridge &amp; Upper Don Ward</i> Jack Clarkson Richard Crowther Keith Davis
8	<i>Darnall Ward</i> Mazher Iqbal Mary Lea Zahira Naz	17	<i>Manor Castle Ward</i> Lisa Banes Terry Fox Pat Midgley	26	<i>Walkley Ward</i> Olivia Blake Ben Curran Neale Gibson
9	<i>Dore &amp; Totley Ward</i> Joe Otten Colin Ross Martin Smith	18	<i>Mosborough Ward</i> David Barker Tony Downing Gail Smith	27	<i>West Ecclesfield Ward</i> John Booker Adam Hurst Zoe Sykes
				28	<i>Woodhouse Ward</i> Mick Rooney Jackie Satur Paul Wood

---

John Mothersole

Chief Executive

---

Contact:

Paul Robinson, Democratic Services

Tel: 0114 2734029

[paul.robinson@sheffield.gov.uk](mailto:paul.robinson@sheffield.gov.uk)

---

## **PUBLIC ACCESS TO THE MEETING**

---

The Council is composed of 84 Councillors with one-third elected three years in four. Councillors are democratically accountable to the residents of their Ward. The overriding duty of Councillors is to the whole community, but they have a special duty to their constituents, including those who did not vote for them

All Councillors meet together as the Council. Here Councillors decide the Council's overall policies and set the budget each year. The Council appoints the Leader and at its Annual Meeting will appoint Councillors to serve on its Committees. It also appoints representatives to serve on joint bodies and external organisations.

A copy of the agenda and reports is available on the Council's website at [www.sheffield.gov.uk](http://www.sheffield.gov.uk). You can also see the reports to be discussed at the meeting if you call at the First Point Reception, Town Hall, Pinstone Street entrance. The Reception is open between 9.00 am and 5.00 pm, Monday to Thursday and between 9.00 am and 4.45 pm. on Friday. You may not be allowed to see some reports because they contain confidential information. These items are usually marked \* on the agenda.

Members of the public have the right to ask questions or submit petitions to Council meetings and recording is allowed under the direction of the Chair. Please see the website or contact Democratic Services for further information regarding public questions and petitions and details of the Council's protocol on audio/visual recording and photography at council meetings.

Council meetings are normally open to the public but sometimes the Council may have to discuss an item in private. If this happens, you will be asked to leave. Any private items are normally left until last. If you would like to attend the meeting please report to the First Point Reception desk where you will be directed to the meeting room.

---

## **FACILITIES**

---

There are public toilets available, with wheelchair access, on the ground floor of the Town Hall. Induction loop facilities are available in meeting rooms.

Access for people with mobility difficulties can be obtained through the ramp on the side to the main Town Hall entrance.

---

**COUNCIL AGENDA  
28 MARCH 2018**

**Order of Business**

---

**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

**2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Members to declare any interests they have in the business to be considered at the meeting.

**3. PUBLIC QUESTIONS AND PETITIONS AND OTHER COMMUNICATIONS**

(a) To receive any questions or petitions from the public, or communications submitted by the Lord Mayor or the Chief Executive and to pass such resolutions thereon as the Council Procedure Rules permit and as may be deemed expedient.

(b) Petition Requiring Debate

The Council's Petitions Scheme requires that any petition containing over 5,000 signatures be the subject of debate at the Council meeting. A qualifying petition has been received as follows:-

*Request For Lease of Former Prince Edward School Building*

To debate a joint paper and electronic petition containing over 5000 signatures, requesting the Council to grant to De Hood Community Project a long lease on the building at the former Prince Edward School. The online petition – <https://www.change.org/p/secure-a-long-term-lease-from-sheffield-city-council-for-de-hood-s-future> - contains 4,658 supporters (as at 20th March) (supplemented by over 400 paper signatures) and includes the following wording:-

*De Hood Community Project needs to secure a long term lease on its existing premises "The Old Prince Edward School Buildings" at Manor Top from Sheffield City Council. The Council would like to demolish the building and grant planning permission to build another Retail Park. We are looking for your support so that we can continue to grow the project and make a difference to the local community, however, without a lease on the building, the future for De Hood is up in the air. The project has made a massive impact on the local community, both young and old, and provides a number of much needed community based activities for the local people to engage.*

#### **4. MEMBERS' QUESTIONS**

- 4.1 Questions relating to urgent business – Council Procedure Rule 16.6(ii).
- 4.2 Supplementary questions on written questions submitted at this meeting – Council Procedure Rule 16.4.
- 4.3 Questions on the discharge of the functions of the South Yorkshire Joint Authorities for Fire and Rescue and Pensions – Section 41 of the Local Government Act 1985 – Council Procedure Rule 16.6(i).

(NB. Minutes of recent meetings of the two South Yorkshire Joint Authorities have been made available to all Members of the Council via the following link -

<http://democracy.sheffield.gov.uk/ecCatDisplay.aspx?sch=doc&cat=13165&path=0>)

#### **5. NOTICE OF MOTION REGARDING "HOMES IN THE PRIVATE RENTED SECTOR" - GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR LEWIS DAGNALL AND TO BE SECONDED BY COUNCILLOR SOPHIE WILSON**

That this Council:

- (a) welcomes the increasing public debate about private rented housing and notes the following regarding the growth of the private rented sector:-
  - (i) nationally the sector has grown significantly since the 1980s whilst the social rented sector has shrunk;
  - (ii) 'generation rent' is all too real: in the UK, 46% of people aged 25-34 and 29% of people aged 35-44 now rent privately, compared to 20% of the population as a whole, and a quarter of families with children now find their homes in the private rented sector;
  - (iii) austerity and the cost of living have made life harder for many private renters and have helped create a "rent trap" for many;
  - (iv) Sheffield's private rented sector has doubled in size during the past decade to over 38,000 households, about 16% of all Sheffield's housing, and is further predicted to grow to reach 25% of all housing in 2025; and
  - (v) Sheffield's private rented housing is diverse – ranging from purpose-built flats to former council housing sold under 'Right to Buy'; from student Houses of Multiple Occupation to families in terraced housing – with strong concentrations in

some neighbourhoods;

- (b) believes these changes in the housing market have produced the following challenges:-
  - (i) how to help people afford to enter and maintain a private tenancy;
  - (ii) how to change the sector to recognise that people are spending longer periods of their life privately renting than used to be typical;
  - (iii) how to help those who wish to move out of the private rented sector to do so;
  - (iv) how to help neighbourhoods with high numbers of privately-rented homes maintain a sense of community despite the turnover of neighbours; and
  - (v) how to fund council services to help private renters when the Government has imposed austerity, unfairly and unnecessarily slashing local government budgets;
- (c) believes that government policies since 2010 have spectacularly failed to address these growing challenges in the private rented sector, but the new measures finally being implemented - including 'banning orders' for landlords convicted of malpractice, an extension of licensing for Houses of Multiple Occupation, and an end to letting agencies' fees (all previously advocated by the Labour Party) - should be cautiously welcomed;
- (d) notes that a future Labour Government would introduce standard three-year tenancies; cap rent rises by inflation; introduce new legal minimum standards to ensure properties are "fit for human habitation"; and give renters new consumer rights (including tenants' rights to keep pets);
- (e) supports the following measures taken by this Administration to help people who are renting privately in Sheffield:-
  - (i) building new homes, including the first new council homes in a generation, to create more alternatives for those who wish to move on from renting privately;
  - (ii) co-operating with landlords, the universities and students' unions to run the SNUG accreditation scheme, which is achieving better standards for student renters;
  - (iii) assisting tenants to assert their legal rights to the safe and quiet enjoyment of their rented home is making renting in

Sheffield significantly safer;

- (iv) successful prosecutions against unscrupulous landlords – whether resulting in a suspended jail sentence, community service or a heavy fine – send a strong message that this Administration will pursue the strongest possible action against any landlords who are badly letting their tenants down;
  - (v) stepping in to help those at risk of homelessness find a new home through Housing Solutions is an important preventative step;
  - (vi) establishing a Selective Licensing scheme in Page Hall has significantly improved the quality of private rented homes in the area, with landlords investing over £1m in improving property conditions; and
  - (vii) mandating that new student apartments are designed so they can be converted to alternative uses in the future makes sure there is flexibility for these developments as housing changes; and
- (f) notes this Administration’s commitment to:-
- (i) publish a charter for people renting in the private sector, clearly explaining their rights and responsibilities;
  - (ii) act to limit the use of letting boards in neighbourhoods with a high density of privately-rented homes;
  - (iii) publish its response to the recent consultation on whether to introduce a Selective Licensing scheme for Abbeydale, Chesterfield and London Roads; and
  - (iv) continue taking the strongest possible action against rogue landlords through prosecution.

**6. NOTICE OF MOTION REGARDING "DEMOCRACY UNDER ATTACK" - GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR CHRIS ROSLING-JOSEPHS AND TO BE SECONDED BY COUNCILLOR ZAHIRA NAZ**

That this Council:-

- (a) notes that the Government wants voters to present identification (ID) before being given a ballot paper in an attempt to combat “voter personation”, with five local authorities trialling this for the upcoming council elections in May;
- (b) notes with concern this development and highlights that a coalition

of charities and academics has warned the Government that plans to enforce voter ID at the upcoming local elections could 'damage turnout and undermine engagement';

- (c) contends that Electoral Fraud is a serious crime and should of course be combated, however, it is this Administration's belief that there is simply not enough evidence of voter fraud in the UK to justify these potentially damaging pilots, which threaten to disenfranchise members of some of the most vulnerable groups of society;
- (d) notes that in 2016 there were 44 allegations of impersonation out of nearly 64 million votes, reflecting just one case for every 1.5 million votes cast, and that last year there were only 28 allegations of impersonation out of nearly 45 million votes — one case for every 1.6 million votes cast – with only one of these allegations resulting in a conviction;
- (e) contends that whilst the Government has stated that anyone can apply for a Certificate of Identity, if without an identification document, this is still disadvantageous to many and those less likely to possess approved photo ID for a variety of socio-economic and accessibility reasons, and that international studies confirm this assertion;
- (f) argues, therefore, that voter ID reforms could affect young people, older people, disabled people, transgender and gender non-conforming people, BAME communities and the homeless and there is a great risk that these reforms would exclude far more people than the tiny few attempting to undermine the result;
- (g) notes that the Chief Executive of the Electoral Reform Society has stated that "electoral reform is a serious issue – but mandatory voter ID is a sledgehammer to crack a nut";
- (h) notes that Slough Borough Council's Conservative administration originally signed up to take part in the forthcoming pilot but later withdrew amid pressure from opposition Labour councillors, who managed to garner enough cross party support for their motion proposing a U-Turn on the proposals;
- (i) notes that Slough Borough Council's Labour councillors successfully argued that poorer groups were less likely to have access to appropriate ID, such as driving licences, meaning the pilot could disenfranchise the poor, with one councillor declaring: 'We don't want to use the residents as guinea pigs, and I don't want to punish the law-abiding majority or create hurdles for them.'
- (j) supports the sentiments of Slough MP, Tan Dhesi, that 'the Tories are trying to introduce this not to tackle election fraud, but basically



just to knock out not hundreds, but millions, of voters and disenfranchise them';

- (k) notes that there are only a handful of cases of voter fraud but, as the Association of Electoral Administrators have pointed out, the new set-up will require extra training for the staff at polling stations to make sure that genuine voters are not being turned away;
- (l) believes that even if the pilots go smoothly, it will remain debatable whether voter ID in its proposed form will even be effective in tackling fraud;
- (m) notes that in Britain we have electoral officers and a highly-respected judicial system to prevent abuses, and contend that these should be strengthened to tackle electoral fraud rather than potentially disenfranchising millions, as the Government is proposing; and
- (n) believes that, ultimately, the biggest threat for our democracy does not come from a tiny few electoral fraudsters but a Conservative government determined to make things difficult for an electoral base unlikely to vote for them – it is, in effect, gerrymandering at its most dangerous and callous and a real threat to the democratic process in this country.

**7. NOTICE OF MOTION REGARDING "TRUST, TRUTH AND TRANSPARENCY" - GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR MARTIN SMITH AND TO BE SECONDED BY COUNCILLOR SHAFFAQ MOHAMMED**

That this Council:-

- (a) believes that trust, truth and transparency are the bedrock of good governance;
- (b) believes that a lack of openness erodes confidence and trust in local government and agrees with the Leader of Rotherham Council that "you can't be accountable without being transparent";
- (c) agrees with the Chair of the Housing, Communities and Local Government (Commons Select) Committee and former leader of Sheffield City Council, Clive Betts MP, that a council's organisational culture is the most significant factor in whether scrutiny is effective, and that commercial confidentiality should not be used as an excuse to inhibit scrutiny;
- (d) notes that, at the present time, Sheffield City Council does not broadcast or record public meetings, unlike other core city councils, for example Leeds and Manchester;
- (e) notes the recommendation of the Housing, Communities and Local

Government Committee that all contracts should be available to be reviewed by councillors in overview and scrutiny committees;

- (f) notes that over the last three years, the refusal rate (including partial refusals) for FOI requests to Sheffield City Council has increased from 21% to 32%;
- (g) notes that it took more than two years for opposition Councillors to be given sight of the agreements made with Sichuan Guodong Construction;
- (h) notes that more than five years after the PFI contract was signed with Amey, opposition Councillors have still not been given sight of an un-redacted copy of the contract;
- (i) believes this demonstrates a worrying trend towards secrecy and a lack of transparency in Sheffield City Council, which restricts the ability of Councillors and members of the public to scrutinise the activities of the Council; and
- (j) resolves to undertake a wholesale review into the Council's lack of transparency with recommendations from that review to be brought back to full council within a year, and requests the Chief Executive to commission that review.

**8. NOTICE OF MOTION REGARDING "REQUIREMENTS OF THE HIGHWAYS PFI CONTRACT" - GIVEN BY COUNCILLOR DOUGLAS JOHNSON AND TO BE SECONDED BY COUNCILLOR ALISON TEAL**

That this Council:-

- (a) notes that this Administration has repeatedly refused to disclose specific details of the Highways PFI contract signed in 2012;
- (b) notes that this Administration has repeatedly put out statements that:-
  - (i) trees are only felled as a last resort;
  - (ii) trees are only felled in accordance with the 6 Ds criteria: i.e. if they are dead, dying, diseased, dangerous, damaging footpaths, private property or roads, or 'discriminatory'; and
  - (iii) there are no targets to fell trees;
- (c) notes that the Council's refusal to release part of the contract was found to be unlawful by the Information Commissioner, who ordered that these parts of the contract be released;
- (d) notes that the newly-released extracts from the contract show that

there was a contractual requirement for Amey to replace highway trees “at a rate of not less than 200 per year”;

- (e) further notes that it is a contractual requirement for Amey to replace 17,500 highway trees by the end of the 25-year contract;
- (f) believes that the Administration’s statements set out above are incompatible with these contractual requirements;
- (g) therefore asks the Administration to admit that those statements were untrue; and
- (h) resolves that this Council has no confidence in the present Administration to tell the truth.

**9. STANDARDS REPORT 2015-17**

To receive the Audit & Standards Committee’s Standards Report 2015-17, highlighting the activities of the Committee and providing details of the outcome of the Standards complaints received from June 2015 through to December 2017.

The Chair of the Committee (Councillor Josie Paszek) will briefly introduce the report.

**10. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS**

To receive the record of the proceedings of the ordinary meeting of the Council held on 7<sup>th</sup> February 2018 and the special meeting of the Council held on 7<sup>th</sup> March 2018 and to approve the accuracy thereof.

**11. REPRESENTATION, DELEGATED AUTHORITY AND RELATED ISSUES**

To consider any changes to the memberships and arrangements for meetings of Committees etc., delegated authority, and the appointment of representatives to serve on other bodies.

Chief Executive

Dated this 20 day of March 2018

**The next meeting of the Council will be its Annual General Meeting to be held on 16 May 2018 at the Town Hall. The next ordinary meeting of the Council will be held on 5 June 2018 at the Town Hall.**